INTRODUCTION

The Workforce Development Institute’s Child Care Subsidy Facilitated Enrollment Program (CCSFEP) provides assistance towards the significant cost of child care for hard-working families, costs that can jeopardize their stability in the workforce and present significant attrition and reliability issues for New York State employers.

WDI implemented the CCSFEP in 2003 with the assistance of the Capital District Area Labor Federation and its’ Child Care Advisory Committee. The goal of the program is to provide eligible working families with income-based child care subsidies that help offset the high costs, which can consume a large portion of a family’s overall budget. The funding is designed to offset costs for families with incomes between 200% and 275% of the Federal Poverty Level (FPL) who work a minimum of 25 hours per week and have at least one child under the age of 13. Currently WDI is serving working families in Albany, Erie, Monroe, Onida, Onondaga, Rensselaer, Saratoga and Schenectady Counties with incomes below 275% of the FPL.

The program offers families a convenient, respectful process for obtaining financial subsidies, as well as the information critical to accessing quality, developmentally appropriate care for their children. The enrollment process is responsive to the needs of working families, offering a streamlined application process that uses technology and flexibility in enrollment, reducing the need for lost work time for face-to-face meetings.

This report is intended to illustrate:

- How the program operates
- What the results have been
- How the program design improved access to child care services for working parents
- How the program serves as a critical workforce support

Programmatic details can be found within the corresponding appendices: A: Program Goals, B: Program Requirements, C: Eligibility Requirements, and D: Program Process and Structure.
SUMMARY

To date, the WDI CCSFEP has enrolled 5,615 families and has assisted 8,085 children in attending day care, after school, and summer camp programs. While the majority of WDI families work full time jobs, the cost of child care creates a deep financial burden, consuming in some cases, nearly 50% of the family budget.

WDI CCSFEP funding is targeted to serve working families with incomes between 200% and 275% of the FPL. However, given funding shortfalls with the Child Care Development Block Grant (CCDBG) over the past several years, local districts have been forced to decrease their maximum income eligibility level for low income child care subsidy cases and increase the portion that families are responsible to pay towards the cost of subsidized child care, resulting in the WDI CCSFEP serving fewer median income families between the targeted range of 200% to 275% FPL.

Many working families’ household budgets cannot accommodate the cost of licensed/registered child care without subsidy assistance. The WDI CCSFEP provides a means of improving the quality of care for children while providing access to income based subsidies for working families with a slightly higher income level.

Access to child care subsidy assistance provides relief in eliminating a predominant employment barrier that many working families encounter. As a result of enrollment in the WDI CCSFEP, families are able to better focus on their job responsibilities and performance. Many report that they were able to improve their attendance and productivity in the workplace. The WDI CCSFEP provides families the opportunity to develop new job skills, increase work hours, earn higher wages and advance their careers. WDI CCSFEP participant survey results are displayed in the following sections: Implications for Workforce and Economic Development and Surveys, which can be located on pages 10 and 11, respectively.
HISTORY

Organized labor, through the New York State American Federation of Labor-Congress of Industrial Organizations (NYS AFL-CIO), has long sought to help working families by promoting better working conditions and compensation. They understood that an investment in child care is an investment in our future and fought hard to advocate for increased child care subsidies and expanded income eligibility levels at which families are served. As a result of this advocacy, the NYS AFL-CIO’s not-for-profit Workforce Development Institute (WDI) received funding in the New York State Budget for Fiscal Year 2003-2004, with the support of the New York State Legislature, for a pilot demonstration project in the Capital Region (Albany, Rensselaer, Saratoga and Schenectady Counties) and Oneida County to serve working families with incomes less than 275% of the FPL. The pilot was later expanded to include Monroe County in 2013, Onondaga County in 2015 and Erie County in 2016.

The New York Union Child Care Coalition (NYUCCC) of the NYS AFL-CIO and the Capital District Area Labor Federation’s Child Care Advisory Committee supported WDI in the development of a plan for the pilot project in the Capital Region and Oneida County which was consistent with state and federal law and subject to the approval of the New York State Office of Children and Family Services (NYS OCFS). The NYUCCC continues to serve as a vehicle through which the program builds support by cultivating diverse partnerships and strives to increase access to child care subsidies for working families in both Upstate NY through the WDI CCSFEP and in NYC through the Consortium for Worker Education (CWE).
TOTAL PROJECT DOLLARS ALLOCATED

As illustrated in the graph below, WDI's CCSFEP has been funded at a total of $49,162,444 since 2003. Of this amount, WDI receives 10% to be allocated for administrative purposes (wages, benefits, space, equipment, supplies, etc.). In addition, the local social services departments receive a 5% allocation for their administrative services. The remaining portions are allocated directly to the eight participating counties for child care subsidies for working families.

![Total WDI CCSFEP Dollars Allocated](image)

DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION

The data for this report was drawn from the WDI child care database, recipient surveys (p.10-11) and census update data. Participating county general demographic information on population, population age ranges, median income and county population by poverty level is provided below. The information included is derived from the 2016 United States Census Bureau American Community Survey (ACS) results. 2017 ACS results are set to be released later this year. This provides a general background when reviewing WDI CCSFEP data.
### County Population and Age of Children

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>County</th>
<th>Total Population</th>
<th>Under Age 5</th>
<th>Ages 5 to 9</th>
<th>Ages 10 to 14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Albany</td>
<td>308,846</td>
<td>15,442</td>
<td>15,442</td>
<td>16,060</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erie</td>
<td>921,046</td>
<td>49,736</td>
<td>51,579</td>
<td>52,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monroe</td>
<td>747,727</td>
<td>41,125</td>
<td>42,620</td>
<td>44,864</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oneida</td>
<td>231,190</td>
<td>13,178</td>
<td>15,490</td>
<td>12,253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Onondaga</td>
<td>466,194</td>
<td>26,107</td>
<td>27,972</td>
<td>28,438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rensselaer</td>
<td>160,070</td>
<td>8,644</td>
<td>8,804</td>
<td>9,284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saratoga</td>
<td>227,053</td>
<td>11,580</td>
<td>14,758</td>
<td>11,353</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schenectady</td>
<td>154,553</td>
<td>9,119</td>
<td>10,201</td>
<td>9,273</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*County total population and child population by age estimated per the 2016 American Community Survey*


---

### County Family Population by Poverty Level

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>County</th>
<th>Family Households</th>
<th>Below 100% of FPL</th>
<th>100-199% of FPL</th>
<th>200-299% of FPL</th>
<th>Families Funded by WDI 200-275% of FPL*</th>
<th>300-399% of FPL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Albany</td>
<td>69,122</td>
<td>5,077</td>
<td>7,006</td>
<td>8,991</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>8,065</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erie</td>
<td>222,109</td>
<td>21,541</td>
<td>29,562</td>
<td>29,621</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>33,920</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monroe</td>
<td>179,894</td>
<td>19,411</td>
<td>22,475</td>
<td>26,188</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>24,503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oneida</td>
<td>55,064</td>
<td>6,422</td>
<td>7,588</td>
<td>8,677</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>9,408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Onondaga</td>
<td>109,911</td>
<td>11,173</td>
<td>12,764</td>
<td>15,104</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>16,668</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rensselaer</td>
<td>37,775</td>
<td>3,273</td>
<td>3,747</td>
<td>5,015</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>5,843</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saratoga</td>
<td>60,786</td>
<td>2,090</td>
<td>5,315</td>
<td>8,120</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>8,027</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schenectady</td>
<td>28,959</td>
<td>1,620</td>
<td>4,335</td>
<td>4,658</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>3,742</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


*Families actively funded by WDI CCSFEP at the end date of the 2017-2018 fiscal year (3/31/2018).*

THIS DATA SHOWS THAT WDI FUNDING CURRENTLY SERVES LESS THAN 1% OF ALL FAMILIES FINANCIALLY ELIGIBLE FOR THE SUBSIDY.
RESULTS

WDI implemented the CCSFEP in the Capital Region and Oneida County in 2003. Expansion of the program extended to Monroe County in 2013, Onondaga County in 2015, and Erie County in 2016. The image below provides a snapshot of the current and historical impact that the CCSFEP has had on children, families and child care providers in New York State.

CURRENTLY SERVED
April 1, 2017 – March 31, 2018

HISTORICALLY SERVED
2003 - 2018
FEDERAL POVERTY LEVELS OF WDI APPROVED CASES

While the WDI CCSFEP was designed to target moderate income working families within the 200% to 275% of the Federal Poverty Level (FPL) range, the diagram below reflects the reduced FPL levels counties are currently serving with Child Care Development Block Grant (CCDBG) funds.

Federal Poverty Levels (FPL) for Families Served by WDI CCSFEP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Below 100% of FPL</th>
<th>100% - 200% of FPL</th>
<th>200% - 275% of FPL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>200%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>275%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**FPL Levels for Families Served by WDI CCSFEP during the reporting period of 4/1/2017-3/31/2018**

See Appendix C: Eligibility Requirements for Federal Poverty Income Levels.

AGES OF CHILDREN SERVED

There are a total of 2,017 children who were served by the WDI CCSFEP across Albany, Erie, Monroe, Oneida, Onondaga, Rensselaer, Saratoga and Schenectady Counties during the reporting period of 4/1/2017 to 3/31/2018. Their ages (at the end of the reporting period) are broken down as follows:

Ages of Children Served by WDI CCSFEP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Infant</td>
<td>356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toddler</td>
<td>386</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-School</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Age</td>
<td>836</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHILD CARE PROVIDERS

One of the primary goals of the WDI CCSFEP is to elevate the quality of child care choices available to working families. WDI does this by providing parents with information on selecting the right provider, both online and in the application packet. This includes contact information for the local Child Care Resource and Referral (CCRR) agency and the NYS OCFS website and its’ Child Care Provider search capability.

WDI continues to be successful in moving children into regulated (licensed or registered) care:

- 81% of placements were in a licensed or registered site
- 19% of placements were in a legally exempt site

WDI data indicates that many legally exempt providers are relatives, friends or neighbors of the family. Many parents of infants prefer this type of care initially due to both a shortage of infant slots in regulated care and the comfort of known providers. There are also families who need care for children during off hours (evenings and weekends). Since there are few, if any, providers offering this care, families choose legally exempt providers to serve this need.
RESIDENTIAL VARIANCES THAT AFFECT SUBSIDY ACCESS

The amount of a family’s child care subsidy is directly correlated to the family share multiplier that is determined by the individual counties. Families funded by WDI are differentially impacted by the different multipliers in the family share formula. This residential variance can significantly limit a family’s access to quality child care and could mean the difference between licensed care and unregulated care for children.

Family Share Residential Variances

- New York State is 1 of only 3 states that allow individual counties to determine their Family Share multiplier percentages.
- Family Share multipliers can range from 10% to 35%.
- This range creates Family Share copayment disparities for hard working families across the state.

Figures based on a Family of 3 at 200% of the Federal Poverty Level (Annual Gross Income $40,840)

![Chart showing the impact of different Family Share percentages on annual out of pocket expenses and percentage of annual income.]

- Family Share: Annual Out of Pocket Expense to Families
- Percentage of Annual Income vs. Family Share Copayment Cost

Employers regularly identify access to high-quality, affordable child care as a persistent challenge to their workforce. Public investments in child care offer benefits on two levels: support for the current workforce because it enables parents to work, and support for the future workforce because it enables access to developmentally appropriate child care with quality learning opportunities. It is essential to reduce employment barriers that diminish the labor supply pool and constrain economic growth. Adequate investments in child care offer a promising strategy for addressing New York State’s workforce needs and an opportunity to deliver a prosperous future for our children.

"Every year, working families in the United States lose out on $8.3 billion in lost wages due to a lack of child care."

- Center for American Progress, *The Cost of Work-Family Policy Inaction*

WDI CCSFEP Families Report the Following Professional Benefits as a Result of Enrollment:

- 53% Improved Attendance
- 53% Increased Productivity
- 49% Retention of Employment
- 29% Part-time to Full-time Employment
- 27% Professional Advancement
SURVEYS

Electronic surveys are sent to families who’ve at one point had an active case with the WDI CCSFEP. The average return rate is between 15% and 20%. The returns once again highlight what is important to parents when searching for a child care provider and the positive impact of enrollment in the program. Respondents of the WDI CCSFEP survey reported the following:

Factors Considered When Searching for Child Care

- Cost: 89%
- Curriculum: 53%
- Diversity: 20%
- Flexible Scheduling: 40%
- Hours of Operation: 84%
- Location: 96%
- Nutrition: 31%
- Payment Options: 53%
- Personal Recommendation: 24%
- Professional Recommendation: 22%
- Staff to Child Ratio: 44%
- Structured Environment: 56%
- Training, Licensing, Credentials & Accreditation: 56%

Personal Benefits as a Result of WDI CCSFE Enrollment

- Afford Housing and/or Transportation: 51%
- Attend and/or Complete Degree, Certificate or…: 16%
- Enrollment in a Higher Quality Child Care Program: 22%
- Pay Outstanding Bills: 56%
- Pay Student Loans: 18%
- Provide Increased Nutrition: 38%
- Relocate to an Improved Living Environment: 11%
If the WDI CCSFEP was not available, parents say:

- “If the subsidy program was not available there is no feasible way I could afford to put my children in a quality day care program. I already work two jobs to make ends meet and this program has allowed me to continue to work to support my 3 young children. My 2 youngest are able to be enrolled in a licensed state facility which provides a safe, reliable setting with age appropriate educational development. I am truly, truly thankful for the WDI Child Care Subsidy Program.”

- “I am a single mother of two boys and without this grant I would not be able to receive my bachelor’s and continue on to my master’s. I wouldn’t have been able to look for a job that would grant me the ability to gain more case management skills, experience and move up in my career. Without the program I would have to pay over $800 a month out of pocket for child care, which is more than my mortgage. If I had to pay over $800 in child care I would be living in poverty and I would probably have to go back to a job that paid less to receive assistance. I appreciate all that the grant has and will continue to do for my family.”

- “Without the subsidy I would not have enough money to pay for our regular monthly expenses, rent, car, food, day to day expenses. With the subsidy I am able to provide my family with a nice apartment in a good neighborhood, reliable/safe car and food. We still struggle, but without the subsidy we would NOT be able to get by on my salary with the cost of daycare being so high. I am so incredibly grateful for this program and for all of the amazing staff I have interacted with, they have been so kind and always helpful.”

THE NUMBER OF FAMILIES SERVED BY THE PROGRAM WHO ARE IN RECEIPT OF FAMILY ASSISTANCE

The WDI CCSFEP does not serve any families who are receiving family assistance through the counties. These families are currently served by the local County Department of Social Services’ funding.


APPENDIX A: PROGRAM GOALS

The goals of the WDI CCSFEP, as set forth in the legislation and in the WDI contract with the NYS OCFS, are to:

- Improve working families’ access to child care assistance through a process that is user-friendly and efficient. The program was designed to make the process of applying for child care subsidies and enrolling in child care services easier for working parents.
- Extend access to child care subsidies to more moderate income working families with children ages birth to 13 and earning up to 275% of the Federal Poverty Level (FPL); targeting those who earn between 200 and 275 percent of FPL.

APPENDIX B: PROGRAM REQUIREMENTS

The activities required by and outlined in the plan include:

- Facilitated enrollment of families in the child care subsidy program: including application assistance, advocacy when appropriate, and contact with DSS.
- Delivery of information critical to accessing quality, developmentally appropriate care for their children.
- Allows for enrollment of families at up to 275% of the Federal Poverty Level (when funding is available).
- Community outreach to and education of families on child care subsidy eligibility.
- Help and information for families on the selection of appropriate child care arrangements – regulated versus legally exempt.
- Data collection.
- Provision of periodic progress reports.
APPENDIX C: ELIGIBILITY REQUIREMENTS

In order to participate in the WDI CCSFEP a family is required to:

- Reside in Albany, Erie, Monroe, Oneida, Onondaga, Rensselaer, Saratoga or Schenectady County
- Have a child(ren) under thirteen (13) years of age
- Be employed a minimum of 25 hours a week (each adult in the Child Care Subsidy Unit or CCSU)
- Have a qualifying gross income under 275% of the annual Federal Poverty Level (based on family size)

### Federal Poverty Level (FPL) Guidelines 6/1/2017 - 5/31/2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Household Size</th>
<th>100% FPL</th>
<th>125% FPL</th>
<th>150% FPL</th>
<th>160% FPL</th>
<th>175% FPL</th>
<th>200% FPL</th>
<th>275% FPL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>$16,240</td>
<td>$20,300</td>
<td>$24,360</td>
<td>$25,984</td>
<td>$28,420</td>
<td>$32,480</td>
<td>$44,660</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>$20,420</td>
<td>$25,525</td>
<td>$30,630</td>
<td>$32,672</td>
<td>$35,735</td>
<td>$40,840</td>
<td>$56,155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>$24,600</td>
<td>$30,750</td>
<td>$36,900</td>
<td>$39,360</td>
<td>$43,050</td>
<td>$49,200</td>
<td>$67,650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>$28,780</td>
<td>$35,975</td>
<td>$43,170</td>
<td>$46,048</td>
<td>$50,365</td>
<td>$57,560</td>
<td>$79,145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>$32,960</td>
<td>$41,200</td>
<td>$49,440</td>
<td>$52,736</td>
<td>$57,680</td>
<td>$65,920</td>
<td>$90,640</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

APPENDIX D: PROGRAM PROCESS AND STRUCTURE

STAFFING
WDI has 5 staff with responsibility for the CCSFEP across the eight counties.

Program staff includes:

(1) Program Manager
(3) Full-time Program Associates
(1) Part-time Program Associate

With direct responsibility for case management for active and applicant families, providing support throughout the application, child care provider selection and recertification process.

- (1) Capital Region Counties
- (1) Monroe County
- (1) Onondaga County
- (.5) Oneida County
- (1) Erie County

Program Manager
Responsible for overall program management and additional hands-on activities.

Program Associate
Responsible for data entry, eligibility pre-screening, application packets, office management, and database management. This position also includes some responsibility for outreach mailings and event staffing.

COORDINATION WITH COUNTIES
WDI partners closely with Albany, Erie, Monroe, Oneida, Onondaga, Rensselaer, Saratoga and Schenectady Departments of Social Services in the provision of service to clients. A working relationship has been established and maintained through the development of Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between WDI and the local county Departments of Social Services.

Completed applications are brought to the counties by program staff (usually on a weekly basis) and county caseworkers interact with WDI staff routinely. Reduced or flat child care funding
availability has continued to seriously impact county Departments of Social Services, resulting in reduced staffing and a decrease in the number of resident families served.

Please note that CCDBG funding issues have forced local districts to decrease their maximum income eligibility level for low income child care subsidy cases and increase the portion that families are responsible to pay towards the cost of subsidized child care, resulting in the WDI CCSFEP serving fewer median income families between the targeted range of 200% to 275% FPL.

WDI funding continues to provide assistance to many families below 200% FPL who have found themselves over income for county CCDBG funding because of the lowered income eligibility levels. WDI has worked with our partner counties to provide continued services to as many working families as possible.

ASSISTANCE TO FAMILIES

WDI has been able to simplify the application process for families. Many families, however, still view the paperwork and documentation requirements as a barrier. The WDI Program Associates work closely with families and support them through the process.

In an effort to simplify the process and remove perceived barriers, WDI incorporated the following into program procedures:

- A streamlined application process
- Affording families the choice of scanning/emailing, faxing, mailing or dropping off the application and required documentation
- Readily accessible individual application assistance during and after regular business hours
- Communicating by phone or email and not requiring an office visit at any time (although a parent could come to the office if they desired)
- Attending employer, community and organized labor networking events in an effort to broadly disseminate project information
SUBSIDY AND FAMILY SHARE

The WDI CCSFEP funding is dependent on annual New York State budget grants. As a consequence of the impermanent nature of the funding stream, eligible subsidy CCSFEP families receive support with the understanding that it is dependent on funding availability. When funding levels permit, and the family remains qualified, families may re-certify for an additional six months to one year depending on their county of residence.

Family co-pays or family shares are determined by the local county using a formula based on family size and income level and a predetermined county approved percentage (10% to 35%).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>County</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Albany</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erie</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monroe</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oneida</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Onondaga</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rensselaer</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saratoga</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schenectady</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Family Share Calculation

Step 1: Subtract 100% of FPL from Household Gross Income

Step 2: Multiply by Family Share Percentage (County-determined %) to generate an annual share

Step 3: Divide by 52 to generate a weekly share

The amount of a family’s child care subsidy represents the cost of child care minus the family’s co-pay or family share. Family Share increases as family income increases. WDI CCSFEP families are differentially impacted by the different multipliers in the family share formula. This residential variance can significantly limit a family’s access to quality child care and could mean the difference between licensed care and unregulated care for children.